# Teaching Students with Intellectual Disabilities to Transfer Early Reading Skills to Text

Dr. Jill H. Allor Southern Methodist University CEC, April 2011



## Literature Review: Reading and Intellectual Disabilities (ID)

- Minimal amount of research
- Focused on mild ID, not moderate ID
- Focused on isolated subskills
  - Students with moderate to severe ID are able to learn to automatically recognize a fairly large number of words (sight words; memorizing whole words)
  - Phonics research is promising

Browder, Wakeman, Spooner, Ahlgrim-Delzell, & Algozzine, 2006; Conners, Rosenquist, Sligh, Atwell, & Kiser, 2006



## Recent Research on Comprehensive Reading Instruction

- Students with IDs respond favorably to comprehensive research-based reading instruction
  - If individualized and delivered with high fidelity
  - If intense
  - Allor, Mathes, Roberts, Cheatham, and Champlin, 2010 (IQs ranging from 40–79; Report after year 3)
  - Browder, Ahlgrim-Delzell, Courtade, Gibbs, & Flowers, 2008 (IQs 55 or below, limited verbal skills)



## Context for this study: Longitudinal Study (Year 4)

141 students participated at least one year	Treatment	Contrast
Borderline IQ* (70-79) *WASI or school testing	<i>n</i> = 35	n = 35
Mild IQ (55-69)	<i>n</i> = 21	<i>n</i> = 16
Moderate IQ (40-54)	<i>n</i> = 20	<i>n</i> = 14
TOTAL	<i>n</i> = 76	<i>n</i> = 65

# Findings

- Year 3 published Allor, et al., 2010, Psychology in the Schools
- Year 4 not yet published
- Support for use of scientifically-based reading instruction for students with low IQs (including ID range)
- IF Individualized and with high degrees of fidelity
- IF provided <u>intensive</u>, comprehensive instruction over an extended period of time

## Findings after Year 4



# A small number of students...

- Experienced extreme difficulty with early word recognition skills
  - Irregular words (e.g. *was*)
  - Regular words (e.g. *sat*)
- Blended sounds together to form a few simple words (e.g. fan, sat), but often unable to decode same or similar words in connected text
- Experienced severe difficulty transferring skills to new activity/context
  - Lesson to text

 Activity to activity (e.g. applying oral blending skills to sounding out printed words)

# Transfer Skills Research

- National Research Council, 1999
  - Begins with knowledge and skills learners bring to a task (initial threshold is necessary)
  - Active engagement

- Flexible understanding of when and how to use skill
- Students with ID
  - Katz (1962) importance of meaning to transfer
  - Neville and Vandever (1976) gradual development of increasingly more complex reading skills promotes transfer
  - Conners, Rosenquist, et al. (2006) transfer phonics skills to new words

# Purpose of Study

- Develop and test the effectiveness of "application" lessons specifically designed to strengthen early literacy skills and explicitly teach students to apply those skills to words both in and out of context
  - Were not transferring blending skills to same or similar words
  - Were not recognizing taught sight words in context
  - Number of words unitized (i.e. read within 2-4 seconds) very limited



# **Research Question**

Would application lessons designed to teach students to improve and transfer early reading skills to specific connected text result in improved student ability to quickly identify words (i.e. unitize) both in and out of context?



# Participants for Present Study

- Students selected from the longitudinal study
- Identified with Intellectual Disabilities (i.e. mental retardation)
- Taught in self-contained setting

- Participated in intervention study for 1-3 years
- Experienced extreme difficulty with early word recognition skills and transfer of skills in and out of context

# Participants (cont.)

- Justin
  - IQ 52, 3<sup>rd</sup> grade
  - English Language Learner
  - In second year of participation in longitudinal study
- Grace
  - IQ 59, 4<sup>th</sup> grade
  - In fourth year of participation
- Kristen
  - IQ 45, 6<sup>th</sup> grade
  - In third year of participation



## Intervention: Developed Word List, Texts and Lessons

#### Word list

- high frequency regular and irregular words, as well as other regular words
- tailored to the letter-sounds students had learned (i.e. 4 short vowels and many consonants)
- 4 books
  - included predominately words from the list

- Lessons
  - taught the words in the new texts using the same formats as in the longitudinal study (*Early Interventions in Reading*, a direct instruction program)

New Words Intr	New Words Introduced in Each Book			
Irregular Words	Regular Words			
Fun w	Fun with Friends			
a	back	not		
come	but	on		
do	can	run		
Ι	dig	sand		
is	fast	she		
like	fun	sit		
of	go	still		
play	if	stop		
see	in	sun		
the	it	top		
to	lot	up		
very	me	will		
want	must			
was	no			
40 new wo	40 new words introduced			
40 total words on t	40 total words on the word list assessment			

Up at Bat			
here	at	miss	
look	bam	much	
said	bat	pick	
you	crack	pitch	
	did	Sam	
	ducks	splash	
	glad	that	
	he	Tom	
	hit	wish	
	Jack	with	
	land		
25 new w	ords introduce	ed	
65 total words on	the word list a	issessment	





By Joanna Guinther Illustrated by Dick Smolinski Adapted by Jill Allor



Where will the ball go?



Crack! The bat hits the ball. "I did it! I did it!" said Sam. "I hit the ball." "Look at the ball!" said Tom. "Look at the ball go up, up, up!" Where will the ball go? Crack! The bat hits the ball.

"I did it! I did it!" said Sam. "I hit the ball."

"Look at the ball!" said Tom. "Look at the

ball go up, up, up!

Where will the ball go?

	The	T C	
	1110	e Lost Cat	
	for	am	mom
	happy	and	nap
	her	be	pan
	likes	big	pot
	little	blocks	Puff
	my	box	soft
	of	cat	stack
	where	dad	stuff
		had	this
		jump	tub
		lost	
	29 new we	ords introduce	ed
94	total words on t	the word list a	ssessment
	Waka	Un Cincon	
	<i>wake</i>	<i>Op, Ginger</i>	
	are	bit	mop
	catch	can't	ott
	come	get	ran
	his	got	rug
	there	hid	soft
	what	just	stuck
	18 new w	ords introduce	ed
112	2 total words on	the word list a	assessment







## **Baseline and Measurement**

- During baseline, instruction focused on oral language development and did not include word recognition
- Cumulative word list
  - Book 1: 40 words on assessment
  - Book 2: 65 words on assessment
  - Book 3: 94 words on assessment
  - Book 4: 112 words on assessment
- Words presented in a random order
- Scored as correct if pronounced word within
  - 3-4 seconds



Figure X. Words read correct on proximal measure during baseline and intervention

#### Justin - Words Read Correctly







# Descriptive Statistics: means and standard deviations by phase

Student	# of	Baseline	Book 1	Book 2	Book 3	Book 4
	Lessons					
Justin	50	6.85	23.56	48.38	59.44	65.75
		(0.69)	(9.28)	(5.77)	(5.21)	(4.69)
Grace	47	15.13	29.38	44.55	52.69	54.30
		(3.88)	(3.25)	(5.63)	(5.86)	(4.47)
Kristen	38	6.56	25.63	42.18		
		(1.79)	(7.09)	(7.68)		



# Results

- Level baseline established in 2 of 3 participants
- Statistically significant slopes between and within phases
- Variability within phases shows a consistent pattern of treatment change (i.e. growth)
- The percentage of nonoverlapping data points was high



# Other Data: DIBELS

Student	PSF	NWF	ORF
Justin	15	30	10
Grace	20	41	16
Kristen	20	23	15

All students began longitudinal study at 0
Scores are the highest score in the last few weeks of the study



# Findings

- Application lessons were effective in improving student ability to quickly identify words both in and out of context
- After participating in lessons, students unitized (pronounced within 3-4 seconds) words from books when presented in a random order
- Oral reading fluency measures (DIBELS) revealed some growth



# Implications

- Need to teach word recognition skills in a meaningful manner
- Need to directly link lessons to text being read, particularly for most challenging students
- Need early text that is meaningful (i.e. more easily comprehended) than typical existing early reading text



## References and Resources: Study Articles

- (year 2) Allor, J.H., Mathes, P.G., Roberts J.K., Jones, F.G., & Champlin, T. (2010). Teaching students with moderate intellectual disabilities to read: An experimental examination of a comprehensive reading intervention. *Education and Training in Autism and Developmental Disabilities*, 45, 3–22.
- (year 3) Allor, J.H., Mathes, P.G., Roberts, J.K., Cheatham, J., & Champlin, T. (in press). Comprehensive reading instruction for students with intellectual disabilities: Findings from the first three years of a longitudinal study. *Psychology in the Schools.*
- Allor, J.H., Gifford, D.B., & Champlin, T. M. (manuscript in progress). Teaching students with intellectual disabilities to unitize words and transfer early reading skills to connected text.

## References and Resources: Practitioner Articles

- Allor, J.H., Champlin, T.M., Gifford, D.B., & Mathes, P.G. (in review). Methods for increasing the intensity of reading instruction for students with intellectual disabilities. *Education and Training in Autism and Developmental Disabilities.*
- Allor, J.H., Mathes, P.G., Champlin, T., & Cheatham, J.P. (2009). Research-based techniques for teaching early reading skills to students with intellectual disabilities. *Education and Training in Developmental Disabilities*, 44, 356–366.
- Allor, J.H., Mathes, P.G., Jones, F.G., Champlin, T., & Cheatham, J.P. (2010). Individualized research-based reading instruction for students with intellectual disabilities. *TEACHING Exceptional Children*, 42, 6-12.

## References and Resources (cont.)

Project Maximize at SMU
 www.smu.edu/maximize

Institute of Evidence-Based Education at SMU <u>www.smu.edu/evidencebasededucation</u>

