

Maguire Ethics Essay Contest Scoring Rubric

The scoring rubric for the Maguire Center's Ethics Essay Prize was developed by the faculty and staff of the Maguire Ethics Center through examination of existing campus scoring rubrics and related documents for essay contests. The rubric articulates the fundamental criteria for judging the essay submissions and provides reviewers with sample considerations for each judging criteria.

Evaluators are to score each essay between a 1 and 5 on each of the four categories for a possible 20 points total.

	5: Excellent	4: Strong	3: Satisfactory	2: Lacking	1: Not Acceptable
Clear articulation and genuine struggle with an ethical dilemma	Student analyzes core beliefs or conducts a discussion with clarity.	Student discusses core beliefs and/or ethical dilemmas with some degree of clarity.	Student begins to analyze core beliefs or conducts a discussion with room for improvement.	Student addresses an issue or core belief but does not connect ideas with strength or clarity.	Student does not adequately address an issue of ethics or core beliefs.
Originality and imagination	Student introduces a novel concept or line of inquiry; ideas are expressed with clarity and imagination.	Student introduces an original concept and ideas are expressed imaginatively.	Student introduces a concept that, while not altogether original, is discussed in a thoughtful way.	Student introduces a concept this is not original but discusses it with some clarity.	Student neither introduces their concept with originality or imagination.
A demonstration of robust ethical analysis and moral reflection	Student has identified ethical perspectives/concepts to an ethical question and is able to consider the full scope of their inquiry.	Student has identified ethical perspectives to a question of ethics and is able to consider their inquiry with strength.	Student has identified ethical perspectives or concepts, perhaps inaccurately, and is able to tentatively consider their inquiry.	Student has considered a question of ethics but offers no response and only moderate reflection.	Student has not adequately identified an ethical concept or question and does not provide material reflection.
Quality of writing	Student's style, conventions, and essay organization are excellent and of the highest tier. Little to no errors are detected.	Student's style, conventions and essay organization are very strong. Only a few errors of grammar and syntax detected.	Student displays satisfactory command of style and essay organization, but there are structural problems. Several errors of convention or syntax detected.	Student does not display a satisfactory command of organization, but style may be promising. Several key errors are detected.	Student does not display a satisfactory command of style, convention or essay organization. Many critical errors are detected.